

Post
Hegel
The
Affair
Critic

Proced
Hegel
Critic

MARX: CRITIQUE OF THE HEGELIAN DIALECTIC

p.305: "But inasmuch as Hegel comprehends the negation of the negation in accordance with the positive relation, which is immanent in it...to that extent he has discovered only the abstract, logical & speculative expression for the movement of his."

p.307: "Logic is the money of the spirit, the abstract expression of the speculative value of thought of man & nature. The externality of this abstract thinking is Nature, as it exists for this abstract thinking....."

"There is a double error in Hegel:...The philosopher, who is himself, an abstract form of alienated man, establishes himself as the yardstick of the alienated world....
p.308: "What is regarded as the essence of alienation, which is posed & to be transcended, is not the fact that human essence materializes itself in an inhuman manner in opposition to itself, but the fact that it materializes itself from, & in opposition to, abstract thinking. Hence, despite its thoroughly negative & critical character, & despite the criticism actually contained in it, which often far surpasses the later developments, there is already in the PHEN., hidden in embryo, the latent potentiality & secret of uncritical positivism & equally uncritical idealism of the later Hegelian works--philosophic disintegration & resurrection of extant of Empiricism."

(RD: to concentrate all major criticisms of Hegel, it is necessary here to jump to p.315 where, after speaking about "knowing is its sole. Therefore, something exists for it to the extent that it knows this thing. Knowledge is its single obj. relation...In other words, knowledge knows that only to the extent that it is related to an obj. is it outside itself... On the other hand, in the words of Hegel, there is also here contained the other Moment... that in its otherness it is as such by itself" Marx concludes sharply: "All the illusions of abstract, speculative thinking are concentrated in this judgment." Then, on the following p. (315) Marx show how, "after transcending, for ex., religion...he still finds himself confirmed in religion as religion." Marx reiterates: "Here we have in the root of the false positivism of Hegel, or his only apparently critical position, which Feurbach characterizes as positing negating & the restoring of religion or theology--which is, however, to be conceived more generally...true knowledge and life are self-affirmation & self-confirmation in contradiction with itself, both in regard to knowledge & to the essence of the obj.
"Thus nothing more need be said of Hegel's adaptation to religion, the state, etc., for this lie is the lie of his principle. i.e., pursuing in alienated life "his true human life.")

Marx
Hegel
Critic

Index
Post
Hegel
Critic

The lie is pursuing
his true human life in
alienated life

p. 308: "Secondly, The demand for the vindication of the obj. world for man, e.g. a humanly sensuous consciousness, that Religion, Wealth, etc. are only the alienated actuality & therefore only the road to true human actuality-- this appropriate, or the insight into this process, therefore, appears in Hegel in such a way that sensuousness, religion, state power, etc. are spiritual essences...."

p. 309: "However, to the extent that it (PHEN.) holds fast the alienation of Man, even if Man appears only in the form of Spirit--to that extent all elements of criticism are hidden in it & are often already prepared & worked out in manner far beyond the Hegelian standpoint. The sections on 'Unhappy Consciousness', the 'Honorable Consciousness', the fight for the noble and downtrodden consciousness, etc. etc. contain critical elements--alho still in an alienated form--of whole spheres like Religion, the State, Civil Life, etc."

"The greatness of Hegel's PHEN., & of its final result --the dialectic of negativity as the moving & creating principle-- lies in this, that Hegel comprehends the self-prod. of man as a process...as externalization, & as the transcendence of this externalization; that he, therefore, grasps the essence of labor & concrete obj. man, true, actual man as the result of his own labor. The true, active relating of man to himself...is only possible thanks to the collective activity of man, is possible only as result of his..."

p. 310: "Hegel stands on the basis of mod. pol. eco. He regards labor as the essence...of man...Hegel knew & acknowledged only form of labor, that is, abstractly, spiritual labor."

(RD: No, in early work which Mx dE not know Hegel directly speaks of factory labor & in "Lordship & Bondage" in PHEN. it also appears.)

p. 313: "When actual corporeal Man, standing on firm & well rounded earth, inhaling & exhaling all natural forces, posits...his actual objective essential capacities as alien objects, it is not the act of positing which is the subject. It is the subj-ity of obj. essential capacities whose must, therefore, also be objective... That means that in the act of positing it does not depart from its 'pure activity' in order to create the obj. but its obj. product confirms merely its obj. activity... We see here how thoroughgoing Naturalism or Humanism, distinguishes itself both from Idealism & Materialism, & is, at the same time, the truth uniting both...."

p. 315: "Neither Nature, taken obj-ly., nor Nature, taken subj-ly, is immediately adequate to human essence."

Ex#22: p. 319: "Now we must try to grasp the positive moments of the Hegelian dialectic, within the limits of the category of alienation:

"a) Transcendence, as objective movement... This is the insight, expressed within alienation, of the appropriation of obj. essence through the transcendence of its alienation, the alienated insight into the actual objectification of man... communism is humanism mediated by the transcendence of pvt. prop. Only by the transcendence of this mediation, which is (p. 320) nevertheless a necessary presupposition, does there arise positive Humanism, beginning from itself."

"Thus Hegel, insofar as he grasps the meaning of the positive sense of negation related to itself, even if in an alienated way, conceives self-alienation, and the separation of man from reality a process of self-conquest...."

"b) In Hegel, apart from, or rather as a consequence of

p. 3-KM:CR1 p. 311 (cont.)

the perversity already described, this act appears lastly as formal...

"Secondly, because the conception is abstract & formal, transcendence of alienation becomes confirmation of alienation...."

"3rdly, this process must have a bearer, a subj., but subj. emerges only as result.... (p. 321) Subj. & predicate, therefore, have a relation of absolute inversion to each other, mystical subj-obj. or subj-ity extending beyond the obj., the absolute subj. as process, ... the pure restless circling within itself..."

(3rd note: Mx here says that "further down" he will develop abs. negativity, but the essay remains unfinished. Later on, (p. 323) he again says "we will see later why Hegel separates thinking from the subj." But, again, essay breaks off before he returns to this. And just as (p. 324) he begins analysis of Phil. of Nature & notes that "in a moment" he will examine the transition from this to Mind. he gets to only the 1st 2 quotation from Phil. of Mind without any comment, so the whole Essay stops on par. 324)

p. 321: "The positive contribution which Hegel has made in his speculative Logic is this: The determinate concepts, the universal, fixed forms of thought represent... the necessary result of the universal alienation of human essence & hence also of human thinking. And therefore Hegel has presented & collected them together as moments of the process of abstraction.... (p. 322) The whole Logic is, therefore, the proof that abstract thinking is nothing for itself, that the A.I. is nothing for itself until Nature is something."